

# PhD Thesis

# FACULTY OF HEALTH & MEDICINE SCHOOL OF MEDICINE & PUBLIC HEALTH

Improving Doctor-Patient Communication: Evaluation of a communication skills training program for psychiatry

Philippa Ditton-Phare, BPsych (Hons)

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Medicine

December 2020

This research was supported by an Australian Government Research Training Program (RTP)
Scholarship

## **Statement of Originality**

I hereby certify that the work embodied in the thesis is my own work, conducted under normal supervision. The thesis contains no material which has been accepted, or is being examined, for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being made available worldwide when deposited in the University's Digital Repository, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968 and any approved embargo.

Signed:

Student Name: Philippa Ditton-Phare

## **Acknowledgment of Authorship**

I hereby certify that the work embodied in the thesis contains a published paper/scholarly work of which I am a joint author. I have included below this paragraph as part of the thesis a written declaration endorsed in writing by my supervisor, attesting to my contribution to the joint publication/scholarly work.

By signing below I confirm that Philippa Ditton-Phare contributed a large proportion to the published systematic review within this thesis and, as such, she is first author on this publication. She undertook the literature search and review, set up and managed the systematic review in Covidence, jointly conducted the screening and quality assessment with other authors, wrote up the initial draft of the paper, and finalised the publication with input from the other authors. This contribution was to the paper/publication entitled "Communication skills in the training of psychiatrists: A systematic review of current approaches", published in the Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry, 51(7), 675-692. doi: 10.1177/0004867417707820.

Signed:

Supervisor Name: Associate Professor Carmel Loughland

#### **Ethics**

Full ethics and site approval for studies in this thesis has been obtained from the Hunter New England Health Research Ethics Committee.

HNEHREC Reference No: 15/12/16/4.06 NSW HREC Reference No: HREC/15/HNE/520 Approval number: 10/10/20/4.02

Supervisor's Name/s: A/Prof. Carmel Loughland, Prof. Brian Kelly, & Dr Harsimrat Sandhu

Signed (Primary Supervisor): Carmel Loughland

Signed (Secondary Supervisor): Brian Kelly

Signed (Secondary Supervisor): Harsimrat Sandhu

# **Table of Contents**

STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY	
ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF AUTHORSHIP	
ETHICS	
TABLE OF CONTENTS	
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS	_
REFEREED JOURNALS (DIRECTLY RELATED TO THESIS)	
REFEREED JOURNALS AND BOOK CHAPTERS (INDIRECTLY RELATED TO THESIS)	
LIST OF TABLES	
LIST OF FIGURES	
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	
ABSTRACT	
CHAPTER 1	_
Thesis Structure, Aims and Objectives	
PRACTITIONER-CLIENT COMMUNICATION	
THE PROBLEM OF POOR COMMUNICATION IN PRACTICE	
What is CST?	
Models of Adult Learning for CST	
Models of Evaluation for CST	
CODING MODELS FOR HEALTHCARE COMMUNICATION	
EVIDENCE OF SKILLS ACQUISITION, TRANSFER AND OUTCOMES OF CST	
A Systematic Review of CST in Psychiatry	
COMMUNICATION IN PSYCHIATRY	
THE COMPSYCH CST PROGRAM FOR PSYCHIATRY	
Content of ComPsych CST	
Process of Delivering ComPsych CST	
SPA Evaluation	
CHAPTER 2	
STUDY 1: DOES COMPSYCH CST ALTER TRAINEE SELF-EFFICACY?: A LEVEL 1 EVALUATIO PROGRAM	
SKILLS	
STRATEGIES	
PROCESS TASKS	
COGNITIVE APPRAISALS	
Training Process Why conduct a Level 1 evaluation?	
HYPOTHESES	
METHOD	_
The Intervention	
The Use of Simulated Patients	
Participants	
Procedure	
Data Analysis	
Current Experiences Form	
Results	
Current Experiences	
Cuttett Expetiences	
Factor Analysis	9.1
Factor Analysis	
Factor AnalysisStatistical Analysis	87

STUDY 2: A QUALITATIVE EVALUATION OF TRAINEE REACTIONS AND LEARNING RESPONSE TO COMPSYCH CST	
QUALITATIVE APPROACH	
METHOD	
Participants	
Procedure	
Data Analysis	
RESULTS	
Communication Style	_
ComPsych Training	
Initial Perceptions about the Training.	
Performance Anxieties.	
Training Structure.	
Didactic sessions and resources	112
Simulated Patients.	113
Trainee Feedback	
Learning of Specific Communication Skills.	
Training Benefits.	
DISCUSSION	
STUDY 3: WHAT IS THE OBJECTIVE EVIDENCE THAT PSYCHIATRY TRAINEES AQUIRE COMMU	
THROUGH COMPSYCH CST? – A LEVEL 2 EVALUATION OF LEARNING	
HYPOTHESES	
METHOD	
Participants	
The Intervention	
Coding	
Data Analysis	
Results	
Communication Skills Acquisition (Core Communication Skills Coding Sheet)	
Agenda Setting Skills.	
Checking Skills.	
Questioning Skills	
Empathic Skills.	
Process Tasks Acquisition (Strat-task Checklist)	
Strategy Tasks Acquisition (Strat-task Checklist)	
Simulated Patient Ratings of Trainee Communication (Sim-Patient SPA Checklist)	
Discussion	
CHAPTER 3	
SKILLS TRANSFER	_
STUDY 4: DO COMPSYCH SKILLS ACQUIRED IN THE CLASSROOM TRANSLATE TO THE WORK	
3 EVALUATION OF WORKPLACE BEHAVIOUR	
HYPOTHESES	
METHOD	
Participants	
Procedure	
Data Analysis	
RESULTS	
Core Communication Skills Checklist	
Agenda Setting Skills.	
Checking Skills	
Questioning Skills	
Empathic Skills.	
Process Tasks Acquisition (Strat-task Checklist)	177

Strategy Tasks Acquisition (Strat-task Checklist)	
DISCUSSION	
STUDY 5: A QUALITATIVE EVALUATION OF THE TRANSLATION OF LEARNING TO CLINICAL PRACTICE	
METHOD	191
Participants	191
Procedure	192
Data Analysis	193
Results	194
Translation to Clinical Practice	194
Systemic and Other Issues Influencing Translation of Training to Clinical Practice	196
Patient Consultations	
Discussing a Diagnosis of Schizophrenia.	203
Discussion	
CHAPTER 4	213
STUDY 6: DOES COMPSYCH TRAINING IMPROVE PATIENT SATISFACTION WITH PSYCHIATRY	
CONSULTATIONS?: A LEVEL 4 EVALUATION OF PATIENT EXPERIENCES	215
HYPOTHESES	217
METHOD	218
Participants	218
Measures	218
Procedure	219
Data Analysis	220
RESULTS	220
Discussion	225
STUDY 7: A QUALITATIVE EVALUATION OF PATIENTS' PERCEPTIONS AND EXPERIENCES REGARDING	
COMMUNICATION WITH THEIR DOCTORS	229
Method	
Participants	
Procedure	
Data Analysis	
RESULTS	
What the Doctor Did and Patients' Rating of Doctor	
Global Evaluation of Doctor	
ComPsych Skills, Process Tasks and Strategies Performed By Doctor	
Treatment	
Satisfaction/Dissatisfaction with Treatment	
Adherence to Treatment	
Diagnostic Communication.	
Hope	
Communication with other clinical staff	242
Discussion	243
CHAPTER 5 - SYNTHESIS AND CONCLUSION	248
IMPROVING DOCTOR-PATIENT COMMUNICATION: AN EVALUATION OF A COMMUNICATION SKILLS	
TRAINING PROGRAM FOR PSYCHIATRY	248
FINDINGS FOR APPLICABILITY AND UTILITY OF COMPSYCH CST	249
FINDINGS FOR IMPROVED COMMUNICATION BEHAVIOURS OF TRAINEES COMPLETING COMPSYCH CST	251
FINDINGS FOR RETENTION OF SKILLS OVER TIME INTO CLINICAL PRACTICE	253
FINDINGS FOR PERCEPTION OF TRANSLATION OF TRAINING INTO THE WORKPLACE	
FINDINGS FOR PATIENT ATTITUDES AND EXPERIENCES	
IMPLICATIONS OF THE PRESENT FINDINGS FOR CST AND PATIENT CARE IN PSYCHIATRY	
LIMITATIONS	
Suggestions for Future Research and Future Directions	
CONCLUSION	
CONCLOSION	207

APPENDIX A. REPRINTS OF PREVIOUS PUBLICATIONS RELATED TO THIS PROJECT WH	<b>ERE THE CANDIDATE IS</b>
AN AUTHOR	303
APPENDIX B. LEVEL 1 EVALUATION FORMS	318
APPENDIX C. LEVEL 2 CODING FORMS	322
APPENDIX D. TRAINEE INTERVIEW GUIDE	325
APPENDIX E. CODEBOOK FOR TRAINEE INTERVIEWS	327
APPENDIX F. MODIFIED PIPEQ-OS QUESTIONNAIRE	333
APPENDIX G. PATIENT INTERVIEW GUIDE	334
APPENDIX H. CODEBOOK FOR PATIENT INTERVIEWS	336

## Acknowledgements

There are a number of key people I want to thank. First and foremost, I wish to express my deepest gratitude to my primary supervisor and mentor, Associate Professor Carmel Loughland (PhD). Her advice was paramount to the construction of this thesis. I am grateful for her unwavering guidance and encouragement to persist when things got hard. Without her, this project would never have been realised.

I am also grateful to Professor Brian Kelly (BMed, PhD, FRANZCP, FAChPM) for the strong leadership and expertise he has provided to this project for many years and for his secondary supervision of this project. His advice and wisdom has laid the groundwork for much future research to happen in this sphere.

I also want to thank Dr Harsimrat Sandhu (MBBS, FRANZCP), for not only being an excellent boss and keeping me sane while allowing me the flexibility to do both my job and my thesis at the same time, but also for providing secondary supervision of this project. I am also very grateful to have been able to access the resources of HNET for this research.

Thank you to Dr Sue Outram (PhD) for partnering with me on the qualitative studies in this project and for providing expertise for these. Your expert advice has helped me successfully complete my first qualitative research, which was exciting and fulfilling.

I would like to acknowledge the remainder of the wider research team for their support and expertise in this area, particularly Dr Marina Vamos (MBChB, FRANZCP) and Professor David Kissane (MD, MPM, FRANZCP, FAChPM, FAPM), and our international collaborators, Dr Carma Bylund (PhD), Associate Professor Tomer Levin (MBBS, FAPM), and Dr Yulia Landa (PsyD).

I am grateful for the statistical support provided by the Clinical Research Design and Statistics unit at the Hunter Medical Research Institute. Specifically, thanks to Kerrin Palazzi for assistance with data analysis and Christopher Oldmeadow for advice on the initial statistical methodology.

Thanks to the medical librarian at the University of Newcastle, Debbie Booth, who was instrumental in guiding the initial stages of my systematic review. This was much appreciated.

I am indebted to A/Prof. Martin Cohen, for way back when, starting me on an academic journey 13 years ago. His belief in my ability and support of my professional development is truly appreciated. I would never have imagined I could achieve this without his keen insight, supervision and mentorship at that time, and it was lucky happenstance that he passed the baton to Carmel.

Thank you also to all the people whose assistance was a milestone in the completion of this project, including the psychiatry trainees and patients who participated in this research program, the clinical staff of the mental health units that hosted me on numerous occasions during my data collection, the outstanding simulated patients who contributed to the training, and to HNET staff who assisted with the training organisation.

I also wish to acknowledge the contribution of the Hunter New England Mental Health Service and the Health Education and Training Institute, without whose support and funding this project could not have reached its goal.

Lastly, on a personal note, I also wish to acknowledge the support, patience, encouragement and great love of my immediate family: my husband, Darin; my two beautiful children, Alexander and Amelie; my mother, Kay; my father, Bill; and my brother, Billy. Without you this thesis would not have been completed and I am truly grateful for you all. A final thank you to all my extended family and friends for sustaining me emotionally during this journey.

Yours in gratitude, Philippa Ditton-Phare

#### LIST OF PUBLICATIONS

## **Refereed Journals (directly related to thesis)**

1. Ditton-Phare, P., Loughland, C., Duvivier, R., & Kelly, B. (2017). Communication skills in the training of psychiatrists: A systematic review of current approaches. *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*, *51*(7), 675-692. doi: 10.1177/0004867417707820

## Refereed Journals and Book Chapters (indirectly related to thesis)

- Loughland, C., Kelly, B., Ditton-Phare, P., Sandhu, H., Vamos, M., Outram, S., & Levin, T. (2015). Improving clinician competency in communication about schizophrenia: A pilot educational program for psychiatry trainees. *Academic Psychiatry*, 39(2), 160-4. doi: 10.1007/s40596-014-0195-7
- Ditton-Phare, P., Halpin, S., Sandhu, H., Kelly, B., Vamos, M., Outram, S., Bylund, C.L., Levin, T., Kissane, D., Cohen, M., & Loughland, C. (2015). Communication skills in psychiatry training. *Australasian Psychiatry*, 23(4), 429-31. doi: 10.1177/1039856215590026
- 3. Ditton-Phare, P., Sandhu, H., Kelly, B., Kissane, D., & Loughland, C. (2016). Pilot evaluation of a communication skills training program for psychiatry residents using standardized patient assessment. *Academic Psychiatry*, 40(5), 768-75. doi: 10.1007/s40596-016-0560-9
- Kissane, D., Ditton-Phare, P., Loughland, C. (2019). Communication and relational skills in medicine. In L. Grassi, M. Riba, & T. Wise (Eds.), *Person Centred Approach to Recovery in Medicine. Integrating Psychiatry and Primary Care*. Springer: Cham. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-74736-1

# LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. ComPsych Core Communication Skills	72
Table 2. ComPsych Time Course of Training and Standardised Patient Assessments	79
Table 3. Rotated Component Matrix and Communalities	86
Table 4. Descriptive Statistics for the Two Factors for Current Experiences	87
Table 5. Regression Estimates and Pairwise Differences	88
Table 6. Comparisons between Pre- and Post-training Ratings ( $N = 37$ )	89
Table 7. Trainee Ratings for Items Related to Simulated Patient Performance across Ala	l
Modules	91
Table 8. Trainee Ratings for Items Related to Resources and Delivery of the ComPsych	
Program, Across All Modules (N=132)	93
Table 9. Participant Characteristics (N=17)	103
Table 10. Inter-rater Reliability of Two Coders for Core Communication Skills Sections	·,
Total Skills, Process Tasks, and Strategy Tasks: Videos 1-133 (N=40 per coder)	137
Table 11. Changes in Communication Skill Usage Pre- and Post-training	144
Table 12. Proportions of "Yes" Over Time for Each Process Task	145
Table 13. Proportions of "Yes" (Performed Reasonably Well or Very Well) Over Time J	for
Each Strategy Task	147
Table 14. Simulated Patient Ratings of 'Yes' (agree or strongly agree) over time (SPA)	for
Items Related to the Sim-Patient SPA Checklist	150
Table 15. Pre/Post Comparison of Simulated Patient Ratings of ComPsych Skillsets and	
Overall Total	151
Table 16. Description of Each Trainee Participant	167
Table 17. Changes in Communication Skill Usage from Post-training to Clinical Practic	ce 176
Table 18. Proportions of "Yes" Over Time from Post-training Measurements into Clinic	cal
Practice for Process Tasks	177
Table 19. Proportions of "Yes" (Performed Reasonably Well or Very Well) Over Time J	from
Post-training Measurements into Clinical Practice for Strategy Tasks	179
Table 20. Participant Characteristics (N=17)	192
Table 21. Patient Responses (Proportion of 'Yes') for Each Survey Item for the CST and	
CST Group	222
Table 22. Themes Regarding Benefits from Treatment	225

Table 23. Participant Characteristics (N=24)	233
Table 24. Examples of Communication Skills, Process Tasks and Strategy T	Tasks Portormod
	v
by Doctors, Identified by Patients	236

# LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Integrating core communication concepts. Reprinted from "Communication skills
training: describing a new conceptual model," by R. F. Brown and C. L. Bylund, 2008, Academic
Medicine, 83, p. 40
Figure 2. Kirkpatrick's triangle used in ComPsych, highlighting the hierarchical divisions of the
training evaluation. Reprinted from "Communication skills training for oncology professionals,"
by D. W. Kissane, et al., 2012, Journal of Clinical Oncology, 30, p. 124534
Figure 1 (repeated). Integrating core communication concepts. Reprinted from "Communication
skills training: describing a new conceptual model," by R. F. Brown and C. L. Bylund, 2008,
Academic Medicine, 83, p. 40.
Figure 3. Kirkpatrick's four levels of evaluation, highlighting level 176
Figure 4. Mean score over four time points (where SPA 1 and 2 were pre-training, and SPA 3 and
4 were post-training) of factors 'Own Communication Skills' and 'Training Delivery'. Error bars
indicate 95% CI
Figure 5. Mean score out of 10 for each module of training of simulated patient performance.
Error bars indicate 95% CI
Figure 6. Word cloud representing general qualitative comments from participants in the
ComPsych program94
Figure 7. SPA room with a Canon XA-10 videocamera on a tripod equipped with an Audio-
Technica microphone. There is a clock visible to the trainee conducting the interview and two
chairs are placed at a 75 degree angle towards one another. The frame of the video shot is set the
same for all cameras
Figure 8. Mean score over four time points (where SPA 1 and 2 were pre-training, and SPA 3 and
4 were post-training) of Agenda Setting skills. Error bars indicate 95% CI
Figure 9. Mean score over four time points (where SPA 1 and 2 were pre-training, and SPA 3 and
4 were post-training) of Checking skills. Error bars indicate 95% CI
Figure 10. Mean score over four time points (where SPA 1 and 2 were pre-training, and SPA 3
and 4 were post-training) of Questioning skills. Error bars indicate 95% CI
Figure 11. Mean score over four time points (where SPA 1 and 2 were pre-training, and SPA 3
and 4 were post-training) of Information Organisation skills. Error bars indicate 95% CI 141
Figure 12. Mean score over four time points (where SPA 1 and 2 were pre-training, and SPA 3
and 4 were post-training) of Empathic skills. Error bars indicate 95% CI

Figure 13. Proportion of 'Yes' for Process tasks (Introduced Self; Addressed All Questions;
Explained Limitations of Information; and Used Mixed Framing of Information) over time
(SPAs)
Figure 14. Proportion of 'Yes' for Strategy tasks: Established or reinforced a physician/patient
team; Facilitated coping through offers of help or referrals; and Discussed how the patient's
values may impact treatment/goals of care) over time (SPAs)
Figure 15. Total Sim-Patient SPA Checklist scores of the quality of communication skills pre-
and post-training
Figure 16. Relationship between SP rated communication skills and coder rated CCS
Figure 17. Mean score over time (where SPA 3 and 4 are post-CST scores and the remaining
time points are follow-up clinical interviews 6-18 months later) of Agenda Setting skills. Error
bars indicate 95% CI.
Figure 18. Mean score over time (where SPA 3 and 4 are post-CST scores and the remaining
time points are follow-up clinical interviews 6-18 months later) of Checking skills. Error bars
indicate 95% CI
Figure 19. Mean score over time (where SPA 3 and 4 are post-CST scores and the remaining
time points are follow-up clinical interviews 6-18 months later) of Questioning skills. Error bars
indicate 95% CI
Figure 20. Mean score over time (where SPA 3 and 4 are post-CST scores and the remaining
time points are follow-up clinical interviews 6-18 months later) of Information Organisation
skills. Error bars indicate 95% CI
Figure 21. Mean score over time (where SPA 3 and 4 are post-CST scores and the remaining
time points are follow-up clinical interviews 6-18 months later) of Empathy skills. Error bars
indicate 95% CI
Figure 22. Proportion of 'Yes' for Process tasks over time from post-training measurements
(SPAs) into clinical practice (FU)
Figure 23. Proportion of 'Yes' (performed reasonable well or very well) for Strategy tasks over
time from post-training measurements (SPAs) into clinical practice (FU)
Figure 24. Results from Item 3, patient-centred interaction on the modified PIPEQ-OS
questionnaire. 223
Figure 25. Results from Item 10, outcomes on the modified PIPEO-OS questionnaire

#### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

**Abbreviation Explanation** 

AMEE International Association for Medical Education

BPAD Bipolar Affective Disorder

BPD Borderline Personality Disorder

CCS ComSkil Coding System

CST Communication Skills Training

CIPP Context / Input / Process / Product model

DAS-O Decision Analysis System for Oncology

DOPS Direct Observation of Procedural Skills

ECCS Empathic Communication Coding System

EPA Entrustable Professional Activity

ETOH Alcohol Use Disorder (Ethanol)

FEC Formal Education Course

GPA Goals, Plans and Actions theory

HNELHD Hunter New England Local Health District

HNEMHS Hunter New England Mental Health Service

HNET Hunter New England Training (in psychiatry)

KAAS Karmanos Accrual Analysis System

MAAS Maastricht History-Taking and Advice Checklist

MDD Major Depressive Disorder

Mini-CEX Mini Clinical Evaluation Exercise

MIPS Medical Interaction Process System

NAAS Nonverbal Accommodation Analysis System

NGO Non-Government Organisation

NSW New South Wales

OCA Observed Clinical Activity

OCD Obsessive Compulsive Disorder

OSCE Objective Structured Clinical Examination

RANZCP Royal Australian and New Zealand College of Psychiatrists

RCT Randomised Controlled Trial

REML Restricted Maximum Likelihood

RIAS Roter Interaction Analysis System

SAS Statistical Analysis System

SCCAP Siminoff Communication Content and Affect Program

SP Simulated Patient

SPA Standardised Patient Assessment

SPSS Statistical Package for the Social Sciences

Sz Schizophrenia

TA Thematic Analysis

UK United Kingdom

UON University of Newcastle

USA United States of America

VR-CODES Verona Coding Definitions of Emotional Sequences

#### **Abstract**

Doctor-patient communication is an area of significant focus. For decades, patients experiencing severe mental illness (e.g., schizophrenia), along with their families and carers, have expressed a desire for better communication and information about illness diagnosis, prognosis and treatment. Evidence from other medical specialties (e.g., oncology) show that specific and targeted communication skills can be acquired through communication skills training (CST), translate to clinical practice, and improve patient outcomes. However, in psychiatry, and Australia specifically, there are significant gaps in specialist postgraduate CST programs, and it is largely unknown whether psychiatry-specific CST would translate into psychiatric practice or improve experiences for mental health patients. This issue is particularly important to health service providers, medical educators and policy makers, who need to see a return on training investment, in terms of both skill translation to clinical practice and improved experiences for service end-users. This thesis draws together a systematic review of the research literature highlighting the need for psychiatry-specific CST, and reports on the development of an Australia-based psychiatry-specific program called ComPsych. Qualitative and quantitative methodologies were used to build on previous feasibility and utility research for ComPsych and extend this work in a larger sample, and examine how skills learned in the classroom actually transfer to the workplace, what skills were retained over time, and whether patient experiences were positively affected by the training. Results confirmed the utility and feasibility of the program, that process tasks, strategies and certain skills (e.g., agenda setting) were transferred to psychiatric practice, maintained for up to 18 months, and patients' satisfaction with their treatment and doctors' patient-centred interactions increased. This thesis demonstrates that investment by Health

Services in CST for psychiatrists is beneficial, improves confidence and skills in psychiatry trainees and improves the care experiences for patients.